

**JOINT PLANNING BOARD MEETING MINUTES
TOWN OF STILLWATER/VILLAGE OF STILLWATER
STILLWATER TOWN HALL
October 26, 2020 @ 6:30 PM**

Present:

**Chairman Peter Buck (PB)
Frank Bisnett (FB), Member
Heather (Ferris) Keefer (HK), Member
Kimberlee Marshall (KM) Alternate Member
Randy Rathbun (RR), Member
Dale Smith (DS), Member**

Village Trustees:

**Judy Wood-Shaw, Mayor
John Basile, Trustee
Judy Wood-Zeno, Trustee
Dorothy DeMarco, Trustee
Patrick Nelson, Trustee**

Also Present:

**James Trainor, Attorney for the Town (JT)
Paul Male, Town Engineer, (PM)
Lindsay (Zepko) Buck, Town Planner (LB)
Ellen Vomacka, Town Board Liaison
Sheila Silic, Secretary**

Also Present:

**Ed Hernandez, Village Engineer
James Peluso, Village Attorney**

Absent:

**Carol Marotta, (CM), Vice-Chairperson
Marybeth Reilly (MR), Member**

Absent:

Sher Tedesco

Pledge:

Chairman Buck called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM and led everyone in the Pledge to the Flag.

Review and approval of minutes of Planning Board meeting:

Chairman Buck tabled the approval of the minutes from the September 28, 2020 meeting until the November 16, 2020 Planning Board meeting.

Chairperson Buck	Yes
Member Bisnett	Yes
Member Ferris	Yes
Member Marotta	Absent
Member Marshall	Yes
Member Reilly	Yes
Member Smith	Yes
Member Rathbun	Yes

PB2019-07 Colonial Road Apartments Site Plan, 19 Colonial Road

Chairman Buck recognized Mr. Nicholas Costa of Advance Engineering and Surveying PLLC who will be representing The BDC Group this evening. Mr. Costa stated that Mr. Cosmo Marfione of The BDC Group and Mr. Derrick Cotler of Cotler Architecture are also present this evening. Mr. Costa stated that the property is located on the west side of Colonial Road in the T5(Town) and V5(Village) Zoning District and consists of 25+/- acres. Mr. Costa stated that the property is owned by The BDC Group. Mr. Costa stated that there have been changes made to the project due to studies on the site. Mr. Costa pointed out the NYS DEC wetland and 100 ft. buffer and the Army Corp of Engineers (ACOE) wetlands on the map to the Board members. Mr. Costa stated that due to the wetlands the layout for the buildings had to be changed on the plans. Mr. Costa stated that they are proposing six 3-story buildings with a mix of one and two bedrooms units. Mr. Costa stated that five of the six buildings will contain 12 apartments per floor for a total of 36 apartments per building. There is one larger building proposed that would contain 18 apartments. Mr. Costa stated that each building will have parking within the first level of the buildings for a portion of the units. Mr. Costa stated that additional parking spaces will be provided adjacent to the buildings. Mr. Costa stated that there is a total of 307 parking spaces. Mr. Costa stated that the project will be serviced by public water and public sewer. Stormwater will be managed on site. , There are sidewalks proposed to be installed from Colonial Road to the public playground on Major Dickenson Avenue. There are two retaining walls needed due to grading. A mailbox kiosk that will also have bulk mailboxes for packages at the entrance with a parking area is also proposed. Mr. Derrek Cotler presented the renderings of the proposed buildings to the Board members. Mr. Cotler stated that the apartments will have in-set balconies. The applicant is proposing two different siding patterns vertical and horizontal. There will be a mix of flats and two-story units . The roofs will be a mix of shingles and gable metal roofing. One apartment building will have a community area. Mr. Cotler stated that they are not proposing elevators within the apartment buildings.

Chairman Buck stated that the majority of the changes to the project are located in the Town of Stillwater and not in the Village of Stillwater. Mr. Costa stated that the Town of Stillwater and the Village of Stillwater line goes through the project, which is shown on the map. Mr. Costa stated that there were two apartment buildings in the Village of Stillwater on the original plans. Mr. Costa stated that due to the wetlands, the applicant only had room to place one apartment building in the Village of Stillwater. Mr. Costa showed the Board members the two apartment buildings that may have to be changed into four smaller apartment buildings on the map. Chairman Buck asked what the cost would be for a 1 and 2-bedroom apartment. Mr. Marfione stated that there are a mix of 1 and 2-bedroom apartments. Mr. Marfione stated that a 1-bedroom flat would be between somewhere between \$995.00 and \$1,000.00 per month. The 2-bedroom flats would be about \$1,300.00 and the two-story, townhouse style would cost a little more. Chairman Buck stated that a 600 sq. ft. apartment is a very small living area. Mr. Marfione stated that they could increase the square footage of the apartment so it could be classified as a studio apartment.

Mr. Basile, Village Trustee, asked Mr. Costa if this is the revised plan. Mr. Costa stated that is correct. Mr. Basile asked Mr. Costa to point out the buildings that are 36 units and which building has 18 units. Mr. Costa pointed out the buildings on the map to the Board members. Mr. Basile asked Mr. Costa for clarification that what is being presented this evening to the Board members is from August 8, 2020. Mr. Costa stated that is correct. Mr. Basile asked Mr.

Cotler to explain the difference between a flat and a town house style apartment. Mr. Cotler stated that a flat is all on one floor and a town house style has a first floor which is the main living quarters and the second floor are the bedrooms. Mr. Basile asked what is the front and the back of buildings from Colonial Road. Mr. Colter showed what would be the front and back of the buildings on the plans to the Board members. Mr. Basile stated that the front of buildings #2 and #3 face one another. Mr. Marfione stated that is correct. Mr. Basile asked how many parking spaces are beneath the apartment building. Mr. Marfione stated that there are 24 garages spaces per 36 units and there are 36 parking spaces per building. Mr. Marfione stated that there are 12-14 flats on the first floor with two or three breezeways to access the apartments. Mr. Basile asked if the stairs are located on the outside or the inside of the buildings. Mr. Marfione stated that the stairs are located on the inside of the building. Mr. Basile asked about the wetlands areas which are adjacent to the Hallum property part of the stormwater system. Mr. Costa stated that these particular wetlands are not part of the stormwater system. Mr. Basile asked where those particular wetlands drain into. Mr. Costa stated that those wetlands drain into the Hudson River. Mr. Basile asked about the circle in the center of the development and asked if it is a round-about. Mr. Marfione stated that it is not a round-about. Mr. Male stated that it is cul-de-sac for fire apparatus. Mr. Basile stated that the buildings that are shown on the plans with Town/Village line going through them should be in either the Town of Stillwater or the Village of Stillwater. Mr. Basile asked Mr. Marfione if the owner of the property is The BDC Group. Mr. Marfione stated that the owner of the property is 19 Colonial Road LLC. Mr. Basile asked about the dog park waste disposal area that is shown on the plans. Mr. Costa stated that it is a container attached to a pole with disposal bags. Mr. Basile asked about the gravity sewer-line and the location of the project which is furthest from Pump Station #1. Mr. Basile stated that the sewer-line for Pump Station #2 runs along the side of this project. Mr. Basile stated that they will need to further review the sewer-line connection. Mr. Basile asked about the amount of flow from the apartments to the pump station. Mr. Hernandez stated that the amount of flow from the apartments to the pump station will have to be analyzed.

Ms. Wood-Zeno, Village Trustee, asked how many town house style units are there in each apartment building. Mr. Cotler stated that there 24 flats and 12 town house style apartments for a total of 36 units. Ms. Wood-Zeno stated that the apartments are not just for the 55 plus community. Mr. Marfione stated that the apartments are not just senior citizens. Ms. Wood-Zeno asked when a traffic study is done do they use cities to calculate the number of vehicles at peak hours. Mr. Costa stated that the numbers that are used for peak hour traffic trips are from the Institute of Traffic Engineers.

Mr. Smith, Town Planning Board Member, asked about the buildings with three floors that are shown on the plans. Mr. Cotler stated that the buildings with the third floor that are shown on the plans are the town house style apartments.. Mr. Smith asked about the three recreation areas in the center and the back of the development. Mr. Marfione stated that on the original plans they were proposing a playground, gazebo area, and a basketball court. Mr. Smith asked Mr. Marfione why they chose this area for a development and why apartments. Mr. Marfione stated that they have a third party that does a feasibility study and determined that there was a need for 184 apartments.

Ms. Keefer, Town Planning Board Member, stated that the apartments are for rent and not for purchase. Mr. Cotler stated that is correct. Ms. Keefer asked when the traffic study had been performed. Ms. Lindsay Buck stated that the traffic study was completed in 2019. Ms. Keefer stated that she agrees with Mr. Rathbun regarding how congested the project appears. Ms. Keefer stated that there are quite a few units in a small area and asked about downsizing the project. Mr. Marfione stated that the project complies with the Town of Stillwater Zoning Ordinance and the Village Zoning Ordinance. Mr. Marfione stated that they would review the density.

Mr. Nelson, Village Trustee, asked what is the cost for renting an apartment. Mr. Marfione stated that the rent will be between \$1,000.00 and \$1,400.00 per unit. Mr. Nelson stated that the basketball court should be added back onto the plans.

Ms. Vomacka, Town Councilwoman, asked what the dimensions are for the flats and townhouse style apartments. Mr. Marfione stated that the 1-bedroom flats are between 600 sq. ft. and 800 sq. ft., 2-bedroom flat are 1100 sq. ft. and the townhouse apartments are 1300 sq. ft. Ms. Vomacka asked if the apartments are subsidized units. Mr. Marfione stated that they are not subsidized apartments. Ms. Vomacka asked if the development has a playground area. Mr. Marfione stated that there was a playground area on the original plans but it was removed because people prefer a dog park and gazebo area.

Ms. Vomacka asked why the buildings do not have the parking located in the back. Mr. Marfione stated that was just how the geometry worked out. Ms. Vomacka asked if the building in the back of the development could be turned so they are not looking at the parking lot. Mr. Marfione asked which two buildings are you referring to. Ms. Vomacka stated that they are the two buildings in the back. Mr. Marfione stated that you want one building to face the other building. Ms. Vomacka stated yes, and it will be nicer for the residents. Mr. Marfione stated that the building can be turned but it will cause more impervious areas in the development.

Village Mayor Wood- Shaw, stated that the residents will walk into the building to access their apartment. Mr. Cotler stated that some of the residents will be able to access their apartment by walking up to their front door. Mayor Wood-Shaw stated that she would like to see some stonework on the apartments when you enter the development from Colonial Road. Mr. Marfione stated that stonework on the apartments is not an affordable concept. Mayor Wood-Shaw stated that she wants the esthetics of the apartments to appeal to the age 55 and over community. Mayor Wood-Shaw stated that Phase 1 will be built first and asked when Phase 2 would be built. Mr. Marfione stated that Phase 2 would be built when Phase 1 apartments are full. Mayor Wood-Shaw asked if there would be sidewalks installed to Ten Broeck Street. Mr. Marfione stated that sidewalks to Ten Broeck Street were not part of the plans but that he would speak to his team about sidewalks from the development to Ten Broeck Street. Mayor Wood-Shaw asked if the residents are allowed to have dogs. Mr. Marfione stated yes, they would be allowed up to a certain weight. Mayor Wood-Shaw asked about the lease agreements and if they are one year or are they short term leases. Mr. Marfione stated that the lease agreements are for one year. Mr. Marfione stated that he tries not to do short term leases. Mayor Wood-Shaw stated that she agrees with Mr. Nelson regarding the basketball court being added back on the plans

Mr. Hernandez stated that the plans do not show the parking on the side of the playground area. Mr. Marfione stated that there is parking on the side. Mr. Hernandez asked if a sidewalk could go from the development to the back of the Stillwater Town Hall property. Ms. Lindsay Buck stated that the Town of Stillwater does not own that property adjacent to the Town Hall.

Mr. Rathbun, Town Planning Board Member stated that there is one parking space per unit. Mr. Marfione stated that there are 1.5 parking spaces per unit. Mr. Rathbun asked about fire access in the development. Mr. Rathbun stated that he has concerns with the traffic and the layout of development. Mr. Marfione stated that the Town of Stillwater and the Village of Stillwater had the traffic study done by Creighton Manning that resulted in no impact except for the intersection by the playground on Major Dickenson Avenue. Mr. Marfione stated that the study indicated that the study predicted a total of 124 trips at peak hours. Mr. Rathbun asked Mr. Marfione if he is proposing improvements to the infrastructure. Mr. Marfione stated that is correct. Mr. Rathbun stated that the development that The BDC Group has in Ballston Spa is very nice. Mr. Rathbun asked about the parking area extension. Mr. Costa stated that is an as-needed parking area. Mr. Rathbun asked what the estimated time for the build-out for the development was proposed to be. Mr. Marfione stated that it will take about 3 years. Mr. Rathbun asked if there have been any comments received from the public regarding this project. Mayor Wood-Shaw stated that there have been comments from the public and they were not positive due to the density, traffic, and location of the ingress and egress.

Ms. Lindsay Buck stated that the applicant should review the design standards for the Route 4 Corridor T5 Zoning regarding the building design, lighting, landscaping, etc. Ms. Lindsay Buck stated that this is the first project that both municipalities are reviewing that pertains to the new form-based code that went into effect as a result of the plan.

Ms. Lindsay Buck stated that the applicant should review the Route 4 Corridor Design Standards for the layout. In meeting discussions that we have had previously we had discussed the need to incorporate those standards into the design for this project. This would lend itself to the idea to turn and move buildings around. Mr. Marfione asked if they were to reduce the size of the buildings, even though the design standards suggest larger buildings, and propose more 18-unit buildings, we would be able to achieve more greenery around the buildings and reduce the parking areas. Ms. Lindsay Buck stated that she agrees with Mr. Marfione.

Mr. Male stated that he spoke with Assessor for the Town of Stillwater and the Village of Stillwater who stated that she would prefer not having the Town/Village line going through the buildings. Mr. Male stated that she would prefer that the buildings are either in the Town of Stillwater or the Village of Stillwater. Mr. Marfione stated that they could make the 18-unit buildings smaller. Mr. Male stated that it would be better to see the buildings from the roadway then parking areas along the roadway. Mr. Marfione stated that moving all the parking to the rear of the project would be a better design.

Mr. Bisnett, Town Planning Board Member asked if all apartments include garages. Mr. Marfione stated not all of the apartments have garages. Mr. Bisnett asked if the third-party engineering firm that performed the traffic study considered the apartments that have been approved on Brickyard Road and the proposed apartments for Halfway House Road. Mr.

Marfione stated that all of those factors were considered. Mr. Bisnett asked about the plans which show a ½ bath on the first floor and no bath on the second floor. Mr. Marfione stated that there are two baths on the second floor a master and on-suite.

Ms. Marshall, Town Planning Board Member, stated that the Corner Stone project which is located in Ballston Spa, are not rentals units. Mr. Marfione stated that the units are not rentals, they are condominiums.

Mr. Marfione stated, to summarize, that the Boards would like the two buildings with the Town/Village line bisecting them moved to either the Town of Stillwater or the Village of Stillwater, more green space, address Mr. Male's comment letter, add a gazebo, review the sewer and add sidewalks to Ten Broeck Street. Mr. Male stated that they will need updated plans for review.

A motion to adjourn was made by Ms. Keefer and seconded by Mr. Rathbun at approximately 6:30 pm.